

#### Territory of Guam Teritorion Guam

CARICE OF THE GOVERNOR FISINAN EMAGA LAHE AGAMA, GUAM MANO US A

MAX 18 1990

The Honorable Joe T. San Agustin Speaker. Twentieth Guam Legislature 155 Herman Cortez Street Agana, Guam 96910

Dear Mr. Speaker:

Transmitted herewith is Bill No. 1114, which I have signed into law this date as Public

Law No. 20-177.

Sincerely,

JOSEPH F. ADA

Governor

200933

Attachment



## TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1990 (SECOND) Regular Session

#### CERTIFICATION OF PASSAGE OF AN ACT TO THE GOVERNOR

This is to certify that Substitute Bill No. 1114 (COR), "AN ACT TO ADD §412 OF TITLE 6, GUAM CODE ANNOTATED, TO MAKE RECORDS OF HOSPITAL STAFF REVIEW ACTIVITIES PRIVILEGED INFORMATION, TO ADD §3285 TO THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM GIVING CIVIL IMMUNITY TO PARTICIPANTS IN CERTAIN MEDICAL REVIEW ACTIVITIES, AND TO AMEND §12231 OF TITLE 10, GUAM CODE ANNOTATED, TO GIVE IMMUNITY TO CERTAIN PROFESSIONAL BOARDS," was on the 1st day of May, 1990, duly and regularly passed.

CERTAIN MEDICAL REVIEW ACTIVITIES, AND TO AMEND \$12231 OF TITLE 10, GUAM CODE ANNOTATED, TO GIVE IMMUNITY TO CERTAIN PROFESSIONAL BOARDS," was on the 1st day of May, 1990, duly and regularly passed.

JOE T. SAN ACUSTIN Speaker

Attested:

This Act was received by the Governor this 14th day of May 1990, at 4th o'clock p.m.

This Act was received by the Governor this Officer Governor's Office APPROVED:

JOSEPH F. ADA Governor of Guam

Date: MAY 18 1990

Public Law No. 20-177

#### TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1989 (FIRST) Regular Session

Bill No. 1114 (COR)
As substituted by the Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology and as further substituted by Committee on Rules

Introduced by:

M. Z. Bordallo

J. T. San Agustin

M. C. Ruth

F. R. Santos

J. P. Aguon

E. P. Arriola

H. D. Dierking

C. T. C. Gutierrez

P. C. Lujan

G. Mailloux

T. S. Nelson

D. Parkinson

F. J. A. Quitugua

E. D. Reyes

J. G. Bamba

D. F. Brooks

E. R. Duenas

E. M. Espaldon

M. D. A. Manibusan

T. V. C. Tanaka

A. R. Unpingco

AN ACT TO ADD \$412 OF TITLE 6, GUAM CODE ANNOTATED, TO MAKE RECORDS OF HOSPITAL STAFF REVIEW ACTIVITIES PRIVILEGED INFORMATION, TO ADD \$3285 TO THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM GIVING CIVIL IMMUNITY TO PARTICIPANTS IN CERTAIN MEDICAL REVIEW ACTIVITIES, AND TO AMEND \$12231 OF TITLE 10, GUAM CODE ANNOTATED, TO GIVE IMMUNITY TO CERTAIN PROFESSIONAL BOARDS.

#### Section 1. §412 is added to Title 6, Guam Code Annotated, to read: 2 Records of medical studies of in-hospital staff 3 "§412. committees. 4 In-house medical, nursing or dental staff committees 5 of a hospital which engage in medical or dental studies to reduce 6 7 morbidity or mortality may make findings and recommendations Except as provided in subsection (b), the written records 8 of interviews, reports, statements, or memoranda of such in-9 hospital medical, nursing or dental staff committees are subject to 10 the provisions of this Title 6 and the Guam Rules of Civil 11 Procedure (relating to discovery proceedings) but, subject to 1 2 subsections (c) and (d), shall not be admitted as evidence in any 13 action or before any administrative body, agency, or person. 14 The disclosure, with or without the consent of the 15 patient, of information concerning such patient to such in-hospital 16 medical, nursing or dental staff committees does not make 17 unprivileged any information that would otherwise be privileged 18 under said laws or rules, and such information subject to 19 discovery under subsection (a) except that the identity of any 20 patient may not be discovered under subsection (a) unless the 21 patient consents to such disclosure. 22 This section does not affect the admissibility in 23 evidence of the original medical or dental records of any patient. 24 This section does not exclude evidence which is 25 26 relevant evidence in a criminal action." 27 Section 2. A new §3285 is added to the Civil Code of Guam to read: "§3285. 28 (a) Civil immunity for physicians, nurse or 29 dentist members of certain boards and committees.

physician, nurse or dentist who is actively engaged in the practice

of such profession shall be immune from civil liability for any act,

decision, or omission done or made in good faith in performance of

BE IT ENACTED BY THE PEOPLE OF THE TERRITORY OF GUAM:

1

30

3 1

duties as a member or agent of committees specified in §412 of Title 6, Guam Code Annotated, when such committee functions:

- (i) to investigate any complaint that a physical or mental impairment, including alcoholism or drug addiction, had impaired the ability of any physician or dentist to practice his profession, and to encourage, recommend and arrange for a course of treatment, if deemed appropriate, or
- (ii) to review the duration of patient stays in health facilities or professional services furnished with respect to the medical or dental necessity for such services, for the purpose of promoting the most efficient use of available health facilities and services, the adequacy or quality of professional services, or the reasonableness of charges made by or on behalf of physicians or dentists, or
- (iii) to resolve questions concerning the admission of any member to, or the taking of disciplinary action against any member of, any medical society or association affiliated with the American Medical Association or American Dental Association; provided, that such entity has been established and duly constituted by a public hospital, or a medical or dental society or association affiliated with the American Medical Association or the American Dental Association or with a governmental agency and provided that such act, decision, or omission is not done or made in bad faith or The with malicious intent... immunity provided by subsection (a) of this section shall not extend to any person with respect to actions, decisions, or omissions, the liability for which is limited under the provisions of the Federal Social Security Acts or amendments thereto.
- (b) Civil immunity of members of, or consultants to, certain boards or committees. Every member of, or health care professional consultant to, committees specified in §412 of Title 6, Guam Code Annotated, shall be immune from civil liability for any act, decision, omission, or utterance done or made in good faith

1

2

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

19 20

2 1

22

23 24

25

28 29

30

3 1

32

33

1 performance of duties while serving as a member or consultant to when such committee functions to review, such committee, 2 evaluate, or make recommendations on: 3 the duration of patient stays in health care (i) 4 facilities. 5 professional services furnished with respect to (ii) 6 the medical or dental necessity for such services, 7 (iii) the purpose of promoting the most efficient use 8 of available health care facilities and services, 9 (iv) the adequacy or quality of professional services, 10 competency and qualifications 11  $(\mathbf{v})$ the professional staff privileges, or 12 13 (vi) the reasonableness or appropriateness of charges made by or on behalf of health care facilities; provided, that 14 such entity has been established pursuant to federal or 15 Guam law or regulation, or pursuant to standards of the 16 Joint Commission on Accreditation of Health Care 17 Organizations; and provided further that such act, decision, 18 omission, or utterance is not done or made in bad faith or 19 with malicious intent." 20 §12231 of Title 10, Guam Code Annotated, is amended to 21 Section 3. 22 read: Good Faith Immunity. 23 "§12231. No member of the Commission on Licensure to practice the healing 24 arts, the Guam Board of Medical Examiners, the Guam Board of Dental 25

Examiners, the Guam Board of Allied Health Examiners, the Guam Board

of Nurse Examiners, the Guam Board of Examiners for Optometry or the

Guam Board of Examiners for Pharmacy shall be liable in any civil action for damages for any act done or omitted in good faith in

performing the functions of his office."

26

2728

29

## TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1990 (SECOND) Regular Session

### ROLL CALL SHEET

Bill No. 1114			Date:	= 5/1/90 early or 2:05
Resolution No.	_			2:05
QUESTION:				
	AYE	NAY	NOT VOTING	ABSENT
J. P. Aguon				harman.
E. P. Arriola	-			
J. G. Bamba				
M. Z. Bordallo	-			
D. F. Brooks				
H. D. Dierking				
E. R. Duenas	-			
E. M. Espaldon	\			
C. T. C. Gutierrez				
P. C. Lujan	<u></u>			
G. Mailloux				
M. D. A. Manibusan	L			
T. S. Nelson	\			
D. Parkinson	Career Commercia			
F. J. A. Quitugua	· ·			
E. D. Reyes	\			
M. C. Ruth	Variation William Will			
J. T. San Agustin	Louis retrains			
F. R. Santos	Kentya kanana			
T. V. C. Tanaka	Lorenza de la companya della company			
A. R. Unpingco	Louis			
CODIED AT COVEDMMENT EXPENS	19	}		1



## Senator Madeleine Z. Bordallo

Chairperson, Committee on Health, Welfare & Ecology Twentieth Guam Legislature

April 23, 1990

VICE CHAIRPERSON:

COMMITTEE ON HOUSING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

#### MEMBER:

Committee on Energy, Utilities & Consumer Protection

Committee on General Governmental Operations

Committee on Justice, Judiciary & Criminal Justice

Committee on Youth, Human Resources, Senior Citizens & Cultural Affairs

Committee on Rules

Legislative Member Commission on Self-Determination The Honorable Joe T. San Agustin Speaker, Twentieth Guam Legislature 163 Chalan Santo Papa Agana, Guam 96910

Dear Mr. Speaker:

The Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology, to which was referred Bill No. 1114: "AN ACT TO AUTHORIZE CERTAIN MEDICAL PEER REVIEW ACTIVITIES AND TO ESTABLISH WRITTEN RECORDS OF MEDICAL PEER REVIEW ACTIVITIES AS PRIVILEGED INFORMATION, AND TO ADD A NEW SECTION 3285 TO THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM RELATIVE TO CIVIL IMMUNITY FOR PARTICIPANTS IN MEDICAL PEER REVIEW ACTIVITIES", does recommend that the Bill, as Substituted, be Passed by the Twentieth Guam Legislature.

Votes of committee members are as follows:

To Pass	
To Not Pass	0
To Report Out Only	2
To The Inactive File	0
Abstained	0
Off-Island	_1_
Not Available	2

Respectfully submitted,

Enclosures

163 Chalan Santo Papa • P.O. Box CB-1 Agana, Guam 96910 • Tel: 472-3425/3426/3427

Madeleine Adeleine

Z. BORDALLO

#### COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, WELFARE AND ECOLOGY

#### VOTING SHEET

ON

#### SUBSTITUTE BILL NO. 1114

"AN ACT TO ESTABLISH WRITTEN RECORDS OF CERTAIN MEDICAL STAFF REVIEW ACTIVITIES AS PRIVILEGED INFORMATION, TO ADD A NEW SECTION 3285 TO THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM RELATIVE TO CIVIL IMMUNITY FOR PARTICIPANTS IN CERTAIN MEDICAL REVIEW ACTIVITIES, AND TO AMEND TITLE 10 GUAM CODE ANNOTATED \$12231 RELATIVE TO GOOD FAITH IMMUNITY"

COMMITTEE MEMBER	TO PASS	TO NOT	TO REPORT TO PLACE IN OUT ONLY INACTIVE FILE
MADELEINE Z. BORDALLO Chairperson			
GORDON MAILLOUX Vice-Chairperson			
ELIZABETH P. ARRIOLA Member	<u></u>		
HERMINIA D. DIERRING Member			
PILAR C. LUJAN Member	——		
Member  EDWARD D. REYES  Member			
ERNESTO ESPALDON Member  Marilyn D. A. Manibusan Member			/4/19/90 milm
MARTHA C. RUTH / WYL) Member	Jn- 4/19/90	· .	
TOMMY TANAKA Member  ANTONIO R. UNPINGCO Member			

#### COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, WELFARE AND ECOLOGY

#### COMMITTEE REPORT ON SUBSTITUTE BILL NO. 1114

AN ACT TO ESTABLISH WRITTEN RECORDS OF CERTAIN MEDICAL STAFF REVIEW ACTIVITIES AS PRIVILEGED INFORMATION, TO ADD A NEW SECTION 3285 TO THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM RELATIVE TO CIVIL IMMUNITY FOR PARTICIPANTS IN CERTAIN MEDICAL REVIEW ACTIVITIES, AND TO AMEND TITLE 10 GUAM CODE ANNOTATED \$12231 RELATIVE TO GOOD FAITH IMMUNITY

#### **PREFACE**

A Public Hearing on Bill No. 1114 was conducted by the Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology on February 13, 1990 at 2:00 p.m. in the Legislative Session Hall.

Members Present: Chairperson Senator Madeleine Z. Bordallo, Senators Pilar C. Lujan and Martha C. Ruth.

Witnesses Heard: GMHA Administrator George B. Palican; Dr. Olivia Cruz, Dr. F.J. Werthmann, Dr. George Guthrie, and Dr. John Steele.

Written Testimony: GMHA Board of Trustees Chairperson Rosie R. Tainatongo; Hospital Administrator George B. Palican; The GMHA Medical Staff, via a petition bearing 49 signatures; Dr. K. Sussman, Chairman, Executive Committee; Dr. Joch C. Steele, Medical Staff Physician QA Adviser; Mr. Kenneth R. White, Mercy International Health Services; Dr. James J. Stadler, Chairman, Pediatrics Dept.; Dr. Jose C. Cariaga; Mr. Mark Eaton, Administrator, Seventh-Day Adventist Clinic; Dr. John R. Taitano, President, Commission on Licensure; John N. van der Pyl, DDS, Chairman of Guam Board of Dental Examiners.

#### SUMMARY OF TESTIMONY

GMH has been cited by HCFA in the past for lack of documented peer review activities. Present peer review meets federal HCQIA standards adopted by the Government of Guam by P.L. 19-42, but are subject to discovery, which "suppresses candor".

Protection of written records from subpoena and immunity for

Protection of written records from subpoena and immunity for participants is ensured by these combined bills. The protections afforded by P.L. 19-42 may be suspended if federal reporting requirements are not met by administrative staff.

No one appeared in opposition to these bills. An amendment was requested by the chairman of the Commission on Licensure and supported by the Chairman of the Guam Board of Dental Examiners, to correct an oversight in Public Law 18-48, relative to Good Faith Immunity.

#### COMMITTEE FINDINGS/RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee finds that passage of Substitute Bill No. 1114 will allow our hospital to carry out necessary in-house research on morbidity and mortality, shield the records of peer review and quality assurance committees from use as evidence, and protect participants from civil lawsuits. It does not shield criminal acts or evidence of criminal acts, or protect against antitrust or other bad faith actions on the part of participants. It also does not compromise or restrict the normal use of patient records.

The Committee recommends that Bill No. 1114, as Substituted, be Passed by the Twentieth Guam Legislature.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

- Voting Sheet on Substitute Bill No. 1114. 1.
- 2. Substitute Bill No. 1114.
- Bill No. 1114, as introduced. З.
- Bill No. 1115. 4.
- 6 GCA Division 1, "Rules of Evidence" (§401 to §411). 5.
- Civil Code of Guam Division Fourth, Title II on Compensatory 6. Relief, where §3285 is added.
- 7. Public Law 18-48, Section 19, on "Good Faith Immunity".
- Title 42 U.S. Code Annotated \$1320c-6, on "Limitation on 8. Liability" under HCQIA. Testimony of GMHA Board of Trustees Chairperson Rosie R.
- 9. Tainatongo.
- 10. Testimony by Mr. George Palican, GMHA Administrator.
- 11. Testimony by GMHA Medical Staff, with a petition bearing 49 signatures.
- 12. Memorandum clarifying oral testimony re: item #11 above.
- 13. Memorandum from Chairman, Executive Committee.
- 14.
- Testimony from Dr. John C. Steele.
  Testimony by Kenneth R. White, MPH, Mercy International Health 15. Services.
- 15. Testimony by Dr. James Stadler, Chairman, GMH Pediatrics Dept.
- Testimony by Dr. Jose Cariaga. 16.
- Testimony by Mark Eaton, Administrator, Guam Seventh Day Adventist Clinic. 17.
- 18. Testimony by Dr. John Taitano, Chairman of Commission on Licensure.
- Testimony of John N. van der Pyl, DDS, Chairman of the Guam 19. Board of Dental Examiners.
- 20. Letter from Gary Hull to GMHA Administrator regarding Bill
- No. 1114 and No. 1115, dated February 9, 1990. Letter from Chairperson Bordallo to GMHA Administrator 1/10/90. 21.
- 22. Letter from GMHA legal counsel to Chairperson Bordallo 1/12/89.
- Fiscal Note on Bill No. 1114. 23.
- 24. Fiscal Note on Bill No. 1115.
- 25. Witness Attendance Sheet on Bill No. 1114.
- Witness Attendance Sheet on Bill No. 1115. 26.
- 27. Committee Member Attendance Sheet on Bill No. 1114.
- 28. Committee Member Attendance Sheet on Bill No. 1115.

## TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1989 (First) Regular Session

Substitute Bill No. 1114 by the Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology

Introduced By:

M. Z. BORDALLO

M. Z. BORDAL

AN ACT TO ESTABLISH WRITTEN RECORDS OF CERTAIN MEDICAL STAFF REVIEW ACTIVITIES AS PRIVILEGED INFORMATION, TO ADD A NEW SECTION 3285 TO THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM RELATIVE TO CIVIL IMMUNITY FOR PARTICIPANTS IN CERTAIN MEDICAL REVIEW ACTIVITIES, AND TO AMEND TITLE 10 GUAM CODE ANNOTATED \$12231 RELATIVE TO GOOD FAITH IMMUNITY

BE IT ENACTED BY THE PEOPLE OF THE TERRITORY OF GUAM:

Section 1. A new §412 is added to Title 6 Guam Code

3 Annotated to read:

"§412. Records of Medical Study of In-hospital Staff

5 Committees.

In-hospital medical, nursing or dental staff committees of a licensed hospital which engage in medical or 7 dental study for the purpose of reducing morbidity or mortality 9 may make findings and recommendations relating to such 10 purpose. Except as provided in subsection (b), the written records of interviews, reports, statements, or memoranda of 11 such in-hospital medical, nursing or dental staff committees 12 13 are subject to the provisions of Title 6 of the Guam Code Annotated and the Guam Rules of Civil Procedure (relating to 14 15 discovery proceedings) but, subject to subsections (c) and (d), 16 shall not be admitted as evidence in any action or before any administrative body, agency, or person. 17

(b) The disclosure, with or without the consent of the patient, of information concerning him to such in-hospital medical, nursing or dental staff committees does not make

- unprivileged any information that would otherwise be privileged under said laws or rules, such information is subject to discovery under subsection (a) except that the identity of any patient may not be discovered under subsection (a) unless the patient consents to such disclosure.
- 6 (c) This section does not affect the admissibility in 7 evidence of the original medical or dental records of any 8 patient.
- 9 (d) This section does not exclude evidence which is 10 relevant evidence in a criminal action."
- Section 2. A new §413 is added to Title 6 Guam Code

  Annotated to read:
- "§413. Proceedings and Records of Medical, Nursing or
   Dental Quality Assurance/Assessment Committees.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

- (a) Neither the proceedings nor the records of organized committees of medical, nursing or dental staff in hospitals having the responsibility of evaluation and improvement of the quality of care rendered in the hospital shall be subject to discovery.
- (b) Except as hereinafter provided, no person in attendance at a meeting of any of those committees shall be required to testify as to what transpired at the meeting.
  - (c) The prohibition relating to discovery or testimony does not apply to the statements made by any person in attendance at a meeting of any of those committees who is party to an action or proceeding the subject matter of which was reviewed at that meeting, or to any person requesting hospital staff privileges, or in any action against an insurance carrier alleging bad faith by the carrier in refusing to accept a settlement offer within policy limits.

(d) The prohibitions in this section do not apply to medical, nursing or dental committees if any person serves upon the committee when his own conduct or practice is being reviewed.

- (e) The provisions of this section do not exclude the discovery or use of relevant evidence in a criminal action.
- Section 3. A new §414 is added to Title 6 Guam Code
  8 Annotated to read:
- 9 "§414. Proceedings and Records of In-Hospital Peer or 10 Utilization Review Committees.
  - (a) The proceedings, minutes, deliberations, findings and reports of in-hospital peer or utilization review committees concerning the health care provided to any patient shall be considered privileged and not subject to discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for their release to any person or entity or be admissible as evidence in any judicial or administrative action for failure to provide appropriate care.
  - (b) Except as hereinafter provided, no person who was in attendance of any such committee proceeding shall be required to disclose any information acquired in connection with or in the course of such proceedings or to disclose any opinion, recommendation or evaluation of the committees formed at any such meeting.
  - (c) The prohibition relating to discovery or testimony does not apply to the statements made by any person in attendance at such committee meeting who is party to any action or proceeding, the subject matter of which was reviewed at the meeting; or to any judicial or administrative action brought by a peer review committee or other legal entity formed to deny,

restrict, or revoke hospital staff privileges or license to practice as a physician or other health care professional; or to such times when the committee may be sued for actions taken to deny, restrict, or revoke staff privileges or license to practice as a physician or other health care provider.

- (d) The prohibitions in this Section do not exclude the discovery or use of relevant evidence in any criminal action; and shall not limit the authority to obtain such information by subpoena or other authorized process from the committees for uses relating to matter and investigations within the jurisdiction of boards created pursuant to Title 10 Guam Code Annotated Chapter 12 to regulate the practice of healing arts."
- Section 4. A new Section 3285 is added to the Civil Code of Guam to read:
- "Section 3285. (a) Civil Immunity for Physician, Nurse or Dentist Members of Certain Boards and Committees. physician, nurse or dentist who is actively engaged in the practice of his profession shall be immune from civil liability for any act, decision, or omission done or made in performance of his duties as a member or agent of committees specified in Title 6 Guam Code Annotated §412, §413 and §414, when such committee functions:
  - (i) to investigate any complaint that a physical or mental impairment, including alcoholism or drug addiction, had impaired the ability of any physician or dentist to practice his profession, and to encourage, recommend and arrange for a course of treatment, if deemed appropriate, or
- 29 (ii) to review the duration of patient stays in 30 health facilities or professional services furnished with

respect to the medical or dental necessity for such services, for the purpose of promoting the most efficient use of available health facilities and services, the adequacy or quality of professional services, or the reasonableness of charges made by or on behalf of physicians or dentists, or

(iii) to resolve questions concerning the admission of any member to, or the taking of disciplinary action against any member of, any medical society or association affiliated with the American Medical Association or American Dental Association; provided that such entity has been established and duly constituted by a public hospital, or a medical or dental society or association affiliated with the American Medical Association or the American Dental Association or with a governmental agency and provided that such act, decision, or omission is not done or made in bad faith or with malicious intent. The immunity provided by \$\$3285(a) shall not extend to any person with respect to actions, decisions, or omissions, the liability for which is limited under the provisions of the federal Social Security Act or amendments thereto.

- (b) Civil Immunity of Members of or Consultants to certain Boards or Committees. Every member of, or health care professional consultant to, committees specified in Title 6 Guam Code Annotated §412, §413 and §414 shall be immune from civil liability for any act, decision, omission, or utterance done or made in performance of his duties while serving as a member or consultant to such committee, when such committee functions to review, evaluate, or make recommendations on:
- (i) the duration of patient stays in health care facilities,
- 30 (ii) professional services furnished with respect to

the medical or dental necessity for such services,

(iii) the purpose of promoting the most

(iii) the purpose of promoting the most efficient use of available health care facilities and services,

4 (iv) the adequacy or quality of professional services,

(v) the competency and qualifications for professional staff privileges, or

(vi) the reasonableness or appropriateness of charges made by or on behalf or health care facilities; provided that such entity has been established pursuant to federal or Territorial law or regulation, or pursuant to standards of the Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations; and provided further that such act, decision, omission, or utterance is not done or made in bad faith or with malicious intent."

Section 5. Title 10 Guam Code Annotated §12231, as added by Section 19 of Public Law 18-48, is amended to read:

18 "\$12231. Good Faith Immunity.

No member of the Commission on Licensure to practice the healing arts, the Guam Board of Medical Examiners, the Guam Board of Allied Health Examiners, the Guam Board of Nurse Examiners, the Guam Board of Examiners for Optometry or the Guam Board of Examiners for Pharmacy shall be liable in any civil action for damages for any act done or omitted in good faith in performing the functions of his office."

27 //////

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28 //////

29 //////

30 //////

727/89 am

TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1989 (First) Regular Session

DEC 28'89

Bill No. ///4(cox)

Introduced By:

M. Z. BORDALLOWA

AN ACT TO AUTHORIZE CERTAIN MEDICAL PEER REVIEW
ACTIVITIES AND TO ESTABLISH WRITTEN RECORDS
OF MEDICAL PEER REVIEW ACTIVITIES AS PRIVILEGED INFORMATION

1	BE IT ENACTED BY THE PEOPLE OF THE TERRITORY OF GUAM:
2	Section 1. A new §412 is added to Article 4 of Title 6
3	of the Guam Code Annotated to read:
4	"§412. Records of Medical Study of In-hospital Staff
5	Committees.
6	(a) In-hospital medical or medical-dental staff
7	committees of a licensed hospital may engage in research
8	and medical or dental study for the purpose of reducing the
9	morbidity or mortality, and may make findings and
10	recommendations relating to such purpose. Except as
11	provided in subsection (b), the written records of
12	interviews, reports, statements, or memoranda or such
13	in-hospital medical or medical dental staff committees are
14	subject to the provisions of title 6 of the Guam Code
15	Annotated and the Guam Rules of Civil Procedure (relating
16	to discovery proceedings) but, subject to subsections (c)
17	and (d), shall not be admitted as evidence in any action or
18	before any administrative body, agency, or person.
19	(b) The disclosure, with or without the consent of
20	the patient, of information concerning him to such
21	in-hospital medical or medical dental staff committees does

not make unprivileged any information that would otherwise 1 be privileged under said laws or rules, such information is 2 subject to discovery under subsection (a) except that the 3 identity of any patient may not be discovered under subsection (a) unless the patient consents to such 5 disclosure. (c) This section does not affect the admissibility in evidence of the original medical or dental records of any patient. (d) This section does not exclude evidence which 10 is relevant evidence in a criminal action." 11 Section 2. A new §413 is added to Article 4 of Title 6 12 of the Guam Code Annotated to read: 13 "§413. Proceedings and Records of Medical and 14 Medical-Dental Staff Review Committees. 15 (a) Neither the proceedings nor the records of 16 organized committees of medical, or medical-dental staff in 17 hospitals having the responsibility of evaluation and 18 improvement of the quality of care rendered in the hospital 19 or medical or dental review committees shall be subject to 20 21 discovery. (b) Except as hereinafter provided, no person in 22 23 attendance at a meeting of any of those committees shall be required to testify as to what transpired at the meeting. 24 25 (c) The prohibition relating to discovery or 26 testimony does not apply to the statements made by any 27 person in attendance at a meeting of any of those 28 committees who is party to an action or proceeding the 29 subject matter of which was reviewed at that meeting, or to

any person requesting hospital staff privileges, or in any

action against an insurance carrier alleging bad faith by 1 the carrier in refusing to accept a settlement offer within 2 policy limits. 3 (d) The prohibitions in this section do not apply to medical or dental committees that exceed twenty-five percent (25%) of the membership of the staff, nor to any of 6 those committees, if any person serves upon the committee 7 when his or her own conduct or practice is being reviewed. 8 (e) The provisions of this section do not exclude the discovery or use of relevant evidence in a criminal 10 action." 11 Section 3. A new §414 is added to Article 4 of Title 6 12 of the Guam Code Annotated to read: 13 "§414. Proceedings and Records of Peer and Utilization 14 Review Committees. 15 (a) The proceedings, findings, deliberations, 16 reports, and minutes or peer review and utilization review 17 committees concerning the health care provided to any 18 19 patient shall be considered privileged and not subject to 20 discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for 21 their release to any person or entity or be admissible as 22 evidence in any Judicial or Administrative action for 23 failure to provide appropriate care. 24 (b) Except as hereinafter provided, no person who 25 was in attendance of any such committee proceeding shall be 26 required to disclose any information acquired in connection 27 with or in the course of such proceedings or to disclose 28 any opinion, recommendation or evaluation of the committees 29 formed at any such meeting. 30 (c) The prohibition relating to discovery or

testimony does not apply to the statements made by any 1 person in attendance at such committee meeting, who is 2 party to any action or proceeding, the subject matters of 3 which was reviewed at the meeting; or to any judicial or administrative action brought by a peer review committee or other legal entity formed to deny, restrict, or revoke hospital staff privileges, or licenses to practice as a physician or other health care professional; or such times when the committee may be sued for actions taken to deny, 10 restrict, or revoke the staff privileges, or license to 11 practice of a physician or other health care provider. 12 (d) The prohibitions in this Section do not 13 exclude the discovery or use of relevant evidence in any criminal action; and shall not limit the authority to 14 15 obtain such information by subpoena or other authorized process from the committees for uses relating to matter and 16 17 investigations within the jurisdiction of health care

18

licensing boards."

12/2/89

### Introduced

TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1989 (First) Regular Session

DEC 28'89

Bill No. /115 (cop)

Introduced By:

M. Z. BORDALLO

AN ACT TO ADD A NEW SECTION 3285 TO ARTICLE 1, CHAPTER 1, PART 1, OF THE CIVIL CODE OF GUAM RELATIVE TO CIVIL IMMUNITY FOR PARTICIPANTS IN MEDICAL PEER REVIEW ACTIVITIES

BE IT ENACTED BY THE PEOPLE OF THE TERRITORY OF GUAM: 1 Section 1. A new Section 3285 is added to Article 1, 2 Chapter 1, Part 1 of the Civil Code of Guam to read as 3 follows: "Section 3285. (a) Civil Immunity for Physician or 5 Dentist Members of Certain Boards and Committees. Any 6 7 physician or dentist who is actively engaged in the 8 practice of his profession shall be immune from civil 9 liability for any act, decision, or omission done or made in performance of his duties as a member or agent of any 10 11 committee, board, group, commission, or other entity, including the Guam Memorial Hospital Authority and the 12 1.3 organized medical staff thereof, when said committee, 14 board, group, commission or entity functions primarily: 15 to investigate any complaint that a physical 16 or mental impairment, including alcoholism or drug 17 addiction, had impaired the ability of any physician or 18 dentist to practice his profession, and to encourage, 19 recommend and arrange for a course of treatment, if deemed 20 appropriate, or 21 (ii) to review the duration of patient stays in

- health facilities or professional services furnished with 1 respect to the medical or dental necessity for such 2 services, for the purpose of promoting the most efficient 3 use of available health facilities and services, the 4 adequacy or quality of professional services, or the 5 reasonableness of charges made by or on behalf of physicians 7 or dentists, or (iii) to resolve questions concerning the 9 admission of any member to, or the taking of disciplinary action against any member of, any medical society or 10 11 association affiliated with the American Medical Association or American Dental Association; provided that such entity 12 13 has been established and duly constituted by a public 14 hospital, or a medical or dental society or association 15 affiliated with the American Medical Association or the 16 American Dental Association or with a governmental agency and provided that such act, decision, or omission is not 17 18 done or made in bad faith or with malicious intent. 19 immunity provided hereunder shall not extend to any person 20 with respect to actions, decisions, or omissions, the
- 23 Civil Immunity of Members of or Consultants to 24 certain Boards or Committees. Every member of, or health 25 care professional consultant to, any committee, board, 26 group, commission, or other entity, including the Guam 27 Memorial Hospital Authority and the organized Medical Staff 28 thereof shall be immune from civil liability for any act, 29 decision, omission, or utterance done or made in performance 30 of his duties while serving as a member or consultant to

liability for which is limited under the provisions of the

federal Social Security Act or amendments thereto.

21

- such committee, board, group, commission, or other entity,
- 2 including the Guam Memorial Hospital Authority and the
- 3 Medical Staff thereof, when said committee, board, group,
- 4 commission or other entity functions primarily to review,
- 5 evaluate, or make recommendations on
- 6 (i) the duration of patient stays in health care
- 7 facilities,
- 8 (ii) the professional services furnished with
- 9 respect to the medical or dental necessity for such
- 10 services,
- 11 (iii) the purpose of promoting the most efficient
- 12 use of available health care facilities and services,
- 13 (iv) the adequacy or quality of professional
- 14 services,
- 15 (v) the competency and qualifications for
- 16 professional staff privileges, or
- 17 (vi) the reasonableness or appropriateness of
- 18 charges made by or on behalf or health care facilities;
- 19 provided that such entity has been established pursuant to
- 20 federal or Territorial law or regulation, or pursuant to the
- 21 Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare
- 22 Organizations, or established and duly constituted by a
- 23 hospital, or with a governmental agency and provided further
- 24 that such act, decision, omission, or utterance is not done
- 25 or made in bad faith or with malicious intent."

#### 6 GCA - Division 1 - Rules of Evidence

#### Article 4 Relevancy and its Limits

§401. Definition of "Relevant Evidence".

"Relevant evidence" means evidence having any tendency to make the existence of any fact that is of consequence to the determination of the action more probable or less probable than it would be without the evidence.

SOURCE: Rule 401, FRE.

§402. Relevant Evidence Generally Admissible:
Irrelevant Evidence Inadmissible.

All relevant evidence is admissible except as otherwise provided by the Constitution of the United States, by Act of the Guam Legislature, or by these Rules. Evidence which is not relevant is not admissible.

SOURCE: Rule 402, FRE.

<u>COMMENT</u>: The Guam Rules omit reference to "other Rules prescribed by the Supreme Court pursuant to statutory authority." The reason for this omission is clear, because the Supreme Court has no statutory authority to prescribe Rules for the Guam courts other than the District Court, over which the Legislature of Guam has no control.

<u>Exclusion of Relevant Evidence on Grounds of Prejudice, Confusion, or Waste of Time.</u>

Although relevant, evidence may be excluded if its probative value is substantially outweighed by the danger of unfair prejudice, confusion of the issues, or misleading the jury, or by considerations of undue delay, waste of time, or needless presentation of cumulative evidence.

SOURCE: Rule 403, FRE.

Character Evidence Admissible to Prove Conduct; Exceptions; Other Crimes.

(a) Character evidence generally. Evidence of a person's character or a trait of his character is not admissible for the purpose of proving that he acted in conformity therewith on a particular occasion, except:

#### 6 GCA - Division 1 - Rules of Evidence

(1) Character of accused. Evidence of a pertinent trait of his character offered by an accused, or by the prosecution to rebut the same:

(2) Character of victim. Evidence of a pertinent trait of character of the victim of the crime offered by an accused, or by the prosecution to rebut the same, or evidence of a character trait of peacefulness of the victim offered by the prosecution in a homicide case to rebut evidence that the victim was the first aggressor;

(3) Character of witness. Evidence of the character of a witness, as provided in §§607, 608 and 609.

(b) Other crimes, wrongs, or acts. Evidence of other crimes, wrongs, or acts is not admissible to prove the character of a person in order to show that he acted in conformity therewith. It may, however, be admissible for other purposes, such as proof of motive, opportunity, intent, preparation, plan, knowledge, identity, or absence of mistake or accident.

SOURCE: Rule 404, FRE.

COMMENT: This Section is modified by new §2080 of the Civil Procedure Code [§8207 of Division 2 of this Title] relative to reputation or opinion evidence of a person's past sexual behavior. With respect to this Section, the Legislature provided, in Section 6 of P.L. 15-60:

"Notwithstanding the provisions of §66 of the Civil Procedure Code, the Judicial Council shall not have the power to prescribe any Rule of Evidence abolishing or abridging the requirements set forth in §2080 of the Code of Civil Procedure. The Editor shall note the provision of this Section in a footnote to §2080 of the Civil Procedure Code."

§405. Methods of Proving Character.

- (a) Reputation or opinion. In all cases in which evidence of character or a trait of character of a person is admissible, proof may be made by testimony as to reputation or by testimony in the form of an opinion. On cross-examination, inquiry is allowable into relevant specific instances of conduct.
- (b) Specific instances of conduct. In cases in which character or a trait of character of a person is an essential element of a charge, claim, or defense, proof may also be made of specific instances of his conduct.

SOURCE: Rule 405, FRE.

#### 6 GCA - Division 1 - Rules of Evidence

§406. Habit; Routine Practice.

Evidence of the habit of a person or of the routine practice of an organization, whether corroborated or not and regardless of the presence of eyewitnesses, is relevant to prove that the conduct of the person or organization on a particular occasion was in conformity with the habit or routine practice.

SOURCE: Rule 406, FRE.

8407. Subsequent Remedial Measures.
When, after an event, measures are taken which, if taken iously would have made the event less likely to occur,

previously, would have made the event less likely to occur, evidence of the subsequent measures is not admissible to prove negligence or culpable conduct in connection with the event. This Rule does not require the exclusion of evidence of subsequent measures when offered for another purpose, such as proving ownership, control, or feasibility of precautionary measures, if controverted, or impeachment.

SOURCE: Rule 407, FRE.

\$408. Compromise and Offers to Compromise.

Evidence of (1) furnishing or offering or promising to furnish, or (2) accepting or offering or promising to accept, a valuable consideration in compromising or attempting to compromise a claim which was disputed as to either validity or amount, is not admissible to prove liability for or invalidity of the claim or its amount. Evidence of conduct or statements made in compromise negotiations is likewise not admissible. This Rule does not require the exclusion of any evidence otherwise discoverable merely because it is presented in the course of compromise negotiations. This Rule also does not require exclusion when the evidence is offered for another purpose, such as proving bias or prejudice of a witness, negativing a contention of undue delay, or proving an effort to obstruct a criminal investigation or prosecution.

SOURCE: Rule 408, FRE.

§409. Payment of Medical and Similar Expenses.
Evidence of furnishing or offering or promising to pay medical, hospital, or similar expenses occasioned by an injury is not admissible to prove liability for the injury.

SOURCE: Rule 409, FRE.

6 GCA - Division 1 - Rules of Evidence

 $\frac{§410}{\text{Withdrawn}}$ 

Offer to Plead Guilty; Nolo Contendere;

Plea of Guilty.

Except as otherwise provided by Act of the Guam Legislature, evidence of a plea of guilty, later withdrawn, or a plea of nolo contendere, or of an offer to plead guilty or nolo contendere to the crime charged or any other crime, or of statements made in connection with any of the foregoing plea or offers, is not admissible in any civil or criminal action, case, or proceeding against the person who made the plea or offer. This Rule shall not apply to the introduction of voluntary and reliable statements made in court on the record in connection with any of the foregoing pleas or offers where offered for impeachment purposes or in a subsequent prosecution of the declarant for perjury or false statement.

This Rule shall be superseded by any amendment to the Criminal Procedure Code of Guam which is inconsistent with this Rule, and which takes effect after the date this Division become effective.

SOURCE:

Rule 410, FRE.

COMMENT: Two changes to this Section. The first reflects a change to refer to the Guam Legislature instead of Congress. The second change refers to the fact that this Rule may be superseded by any amendment to the Criminal Procedure Code of Guam, not to the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, which amendment takes effect after the effective date of these Rules.

§411. Liability Insurance.

Evidence that a person was or was not insured against liability is not admissible upon the issue whether he acted negligently or otherwise wrongfully. This Rule does not require the exclusion of evidence of insurance against liability when offered for another purpose, such as proof of agency, ownership, or control, or bias or prejudice of a witness.

SOURCE: Rule 411, FRE.

CIVIL CODE

#### TITLE XVI

#### General Provisions

§ 3268 Parties may waive code provisions.

§ 3268. Parties may waive code provisions. Except where it is otherwise declared, the provisions of the foregoing Titles of this Part, in respect to the rights and obligations of parties to contracts, are subordinate to the intention of the parties, when ascertained in the manner prescribed by the Chapter on the interpretation of contracts; and the benefit thereof may be waived by any party entitled thereto, unless such waiver would be against public policy. [Enacted 1953.]

#### DIVISION FOURTH

- Part I. Relief.
  - II. Special Relations of Debtor and Creditor
  - III. Nuisance.
  - IV. Maxims of Jurisprudence.

#### PART I

#### Relief

Title I. Relief in General.

II. Compensatory Relief.

III. Specific and Preventive Relief.

#### TITLE I

#### Relief in General

§ 3274 Species of relief

§ 3275 Relief in case of forfeiture.

§ 3274. Species of relief. As a general rule, compensation is a relief or remedy provided by the law of this territory for the violation of private rights, and the means of securing their observance; and specific and preventive relief may be given in no other cases than those specified in this part of the Civil Code or in the Code of Civil Procedure. [Enacted 1953.]

§ 3275. Relief in case of forfeiture. Whenever, by the terms of an obligation, a party thereto incurs a forfeiture, or a loss in the nature of a forfeiture, by reason of his failure to comply with its provisions, he may be relieved therefrom, upon making full compensation to the other party, except in case of a grossly negligent, wilful, or fraudulent breach of duty. [Enacted 1953.]

#### TITLE II

#### Compensatory Relief

Chapter I. Damages in General.
II. Measure of Damages.

#### CHAPTER I

#### Damages in General

Article I. General Principles.

Interest as Damages.
 Exemplary Damages.

#### ARTICLE I

#### General Principles

- § 3281. Person suffering detriment may recover damages.
- § 3282 Detriment, what.
- § 3283. Injuries resulting after suit
- § 3284. Persons rendering emergency assistance exempt from civil hability.
- § 3281. Person suffering detriment may recover damages. Every person who suffers detriment from the unlawful act or omission of another, may recover from the person in fault a compensation therefor in money, which is called damages. [Enacted 1953.]
- § 3282. Detriment, what. "Detriment" is a loss or harm suffered in person or property. [Enacted 1953.]
- § 3283. Injuries resulting after suit. Damages may be awarded, in a judicial proceeding, for detriment resulting after the commencement thereof, or certain to result in the future. [Enacted 1953.]
- § 3284. Persons rendering emergency assistance exempt from civil liability. Any person licensed to practice the healing art under the laws of Guam, or any other person, who in good faith renders emergency care or assistance without compensation at the place of an emergency or accident, shall not be liable for any civil damages for acts or omissions in good faith. [Added by P.L. 7-80, effective January 31, 1964.]

#### ARTICLE II

#### Interest as Damages

- § 3287 Persons entitled, damages, also interest thereon.
- § 3288 In actions, noncontract
- § 3289 Limit rate by contract.
- § 3290 Acceptance of principal waives interest.
- § 3287. Persons entitled, damages, also interest thereon. Every person who is entitled to recover damages certain, or capable of being made certain by calculation, and the right to recover which is vested in him, upon a particular day, is entitled also to recover interest thereon from that day, except during such time as the debtor is prevented by law, or by the act of the

creditor, from paying the debt. [Enacted 1953.] [Capital Ins. Co. v. Globe Indemnity (1967), 382 F.2d. 623.]

- § 3288. In actions, noncontract. In an action for the breach of an obligation not arising from contract, and in every case of oppression, fraud, or malice, interest may be given [Enacted 1953.]
- § 3289. Limit rate by contract. Any legal rate of interest stipulated by a contract remains chargeable after a breach thereof, as before, until the contract is superseded by a judgment or other new obligation. [Enacted 1953.]
- § 3290. Acceptance of principal waives interest. Accepting payment of the whole principal, as such, waives all claim to interest. [Enacted 1953.]

#### ARTICLE III

#### **Exemplary Damages**

- § 3294 Exemplary domages, when allowed.
- § 3294. Exemplary damages, when allowed. In an action for the breach of an obligation not arising from contract, where the defendant has been guilty of oppression, fraud, or malice, express or implied, the plaintiff, in addition to the actual damages, may recover damages for the sake of example and by way of punishing the defendant. [Enacted 1953.]

#### CHAPTER II Measure of Damages

- Article I. Damages for Breach of Contract.
  - II. Damages for Wrongs.
  - III. Penal Damages.
  - IV. General Provisions.

Section 17. The sum of Ten Thousand Dollars (\$10,000) is appropriated from the General Fund to the Guam Youth Football League.

Section 18. (a) The Governor of Guam is authorized to negotiate for fair market value for the acquisition by the government of Guam of that parcel of land in the municipality of Agana Heights identified on the Department of Land Management Record as Document No. 35063 consisting of one thousand five hundred fifty-three and sixty-eight hundredths (1,553.68) square meters for community and recreational facilities.

- (b) The Governor of Guam is authorized to negotiate for fair market value for the acquisition by the government of Guam of that parcel of land in the municipality of Agana Heights identified on the Department of Land Management Record as Document No. 323478 consisting of two thousand eighty-three and seventeen hundredths (2,083.17) square meters for community and recreational facilities.
- (c) The acquisition of the lands identified in Subsections (a) and (b) of this Section shall not be final until approved by legislation other than that contained in this Section.
- (d) The parcel of lands identified in Subsections (a) and (b) of this Section shall, following acquisition, be placed under the administration of the Commissioner of Agana Heights.

Section 19. A new 10 GCA §12231 is added to read: "§12231. Good Faith Immunity.

No member of the Commission on Licensure to practice the healing arts, the Guam Board of Medical Examiners, the Guam Board of Nurse Examiners, the Guam Board of Examiners for Optometry or the Guam Board of Examiners for Pharmacy shall be liable in any civil action for damages for any act done or omitted in good faith in performing the functions of his office."

Section 20. The Governor of Guam is authorized to convey: Lot No. 2417-1-5, Mangilao, Municipality of Barrigada, Guam, containing an area of 7,687 Square Feet to George Q. Acfalle and Jeonalina Acfalle for fair market value.

Section 21. (a) The sum of Thirteen Million One Hundred Twenty-four Thousand Three Hundred Forty-two Dollars (\$13,124,342) is appropriated from the General Fund to the Guam Power Authority for the purpose of liquidating metered billings and penalties incurred by government of Guam line agencies and autonomous agencies, for the periods ending up through September 30, 1986.

for the development of norms of health care services by Professional Standards Review Organizations, was omitted in the general revision of this part by section 143 of Pub.L 97-248

Effective Date. Section effective with respect to contracts entered into or renewed on

or after Sept. 3, 1982, see section 149 of Put. L. 97-248, set out as an Effective Date note under section 1320c of this title.

Legislative History. For legislative history and purpose of Pub L. 97-248, see 1982 U.S Code Cong. and Adm.News, p. 781

#### West's Federal Forms

Sentence and fine, see § 7531 et seq

#### Code of Federal Regulations

Imposition of sanctions on health care practitioners and providers of health care services, see 42 CFR 474.0 et seq.

Professional Standards Review Organization area designations, see 42 CFR 460.1 et seq. Program integrity, see 42 CFR 455.1 et seq.

#### Notes of Decisions

Constitutionality 1
Medical necessity 3
Procedural due process 2

1. Constitutionality

Former section 1320c-9(a) of this title which set forth conditions for having been compensated by federal funds for medicare and medicaid programs, did not bar physicians from practicing their profession and was not so patently arbitrary and totally lacking in rational justification as to be violative of the due process clause of U.S.C.A. Const. Amend. 5. Association of Am. Physicians and Surgeons v. Weinberger, D.C.III.1975, 395 F.Supp. 125, affirmed 96 S.Ct. 388, 423 U.S. 975, 46 L.Ed.2d 299.

Former section 1320c-9(a) of this title merely required practitioners to furnish evidence of their services in order to be compensated and did not violate U.S.C.A. Const. Amend. 5, by having created presumptions inconsistent with presumptions of competence, good moral character and regularity of motive and conduct inherent in medical licensure. Id

Test of whether former provisions of this part was unconstitutionally vague, and repugnant to U.S.C.A. Const. Amend. 5, was whether members of medical profession would necessarily have to guess at meaning of

phrases set forth in such former provisions of this part, such as "medically necessary" "professionally recognized health care standards," and "proper care", and while such phrases were not highly specific, language of legislation was not impermissibly vague or uncertain. Id

#### 2. Procedural due process

Former section 1320c-9 of this title satisfied the demands of procedural due process by apprising practitioner or provider of any adverse determination and by affording him opportunity to be heard either by Secretary or by avenue of judicial review. Association of Am. Physicians and Surgeons v. Weinberger, D.C.III.1975, 395. F.Supp. 125, affirmed 96.5.Ct. 388, 423 U.S. 975, 46 L.Ed.2d 299.

11

(7)

: .

#### 3. Medical necessity

Former section 1320c-9 of this title did not prohibit physician from performing any surgical operations he deemed necessary in exercise of his professional skill and judgment but merely provided that if physician wished to be compensated by federal government for his services he must comply with certain guidelines and procedures enumerated in such former provisions of this title. Association of Am. Physicians and Surgeons v. Weinberger D.C.III.1975, 395 F.Supp. 125, affirmed 96 S.Ct. 388, 423 U.S. 975, 46 L.Ed.2d 299

#### § 1320c-6. Limitation on liability

## (a) Providers of information to organizations having contract with Secretary

Notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person providing information to any organization having a contract with the Secretary under this

shall be held, by reason of having provided such information, to have sted any criminal law, or to be civilly liable under any law of the United tes or of any State (or political subdivision thereof) unless—

- (1) such information is unrelated to the performance of the contract of such organization: or
- (2) such information is false and the person providing it knew, or had reason to believe, that such information was false.

### (b) Employees and fiduclaries of organizations having contracts with Secretary

person who is employed by, or who has a fiduciary relationship with, such organization or who furnishes professional services to such organism shall be held by reason of the performance by him of any duty, functor activity required or authorized pursuant to this part or to a valid struct entered into under this part, to have violated any criminal law, or by civilly liable under any law of the United States or of any State (or annual subdivision thereof) provided he has exercised due care.

#### (c) Physicians and providers

No doctor of medicine or osteopathy and no provider (including directors, trustees, employees, or officials thereof) of health care services shall be willy liable to any person under any law of the United States or of any state (or political subdivision thereof) on account of any action taken by min compliance with or reliance upon professionally developed norms of care and treatment applied by an organization under contract pursuant to section 1320c-2 of this title operating in the area where such doctor of medicine or osteopathy or provider took such action; but only if—

- (1) he takes such action in the exercise of his profession as a doctor of medicine or osteopathy or in the exercise of his functions as a provider of health care services; and
- (2) he exercised due care in all professional conduct taken or directed by him and reasonably related to, and resulting from, the actions taken in compliance with or reliance upon such professionally accepted norms of care and treatment.

### (d) Reimbursement by Secretary for expenses incurred in defense of legal proceedings

The Secretary shall make payment to an organization under contract with nini pursuant to this part, or to any member or employee thereof, or to any retson who furnishes legal counsel or services to such organization, in an amount equal to the reasonable amount of the expenses incurred, as determined by the Secretary, in connection with the defense of any suit, action, proceeding brought against such organization, member, or employee resolve to the performance of any duty or function under such contract by organization, member, or employee.

14. 1935, c. 531, Title XI, § 1157, as added Sept. 3, 1982, Pub.L. 97-248, 4 o. L. § 143, 96 Stat. 389.)

#### Historical Note

Prior Provisions. A prior section 1320c-6, Act Aug. 14, 1935, c. 531, Title XI, § 1157, as added Oct. 30, 1972, Pub.L. 92-603, Title II, § 249F(b), 36 Stat. 1437, and amended Oct. 25, 1977, Pub.L. 95-142, § 13(b)(4), 91 Stat. 1198, which related to the submission of reports by Professional Standards Review Organizations, was omitted in the general revision of this part by section 143 of Pub.L. 97-748

Effective Date. Section effective with spect to contracts entered into or renewed or after Sept. 3, 1982, see section (49 of Pur L. 97-248, set out as an Effective Date note under section 1320c of this title.

Legislative History. For legislative history and purpose of Pub.L. 97-248, see 1982 U.S. Code Cong. and Adm. News. p. 781.

#### Notes of Decisions

Compliance with norms of care 1 Persons entitled to maintain action 2 civil liability. Association of Am. Physicians and Surgeons v. Weinberger, D.C.III.1975 395 F.Supp. 125. affirmed 96 S.Ct. 388, 422 U.S. 975, 46 L Ed.2d 299.

#### 1. Compliance with norms of care

Where norms which were to have been established and which plaintiffs would have had to comply with were, by definition, typical medical practices, risk of civil liability would have ansen from common law standards of negligence, not from former section 1320c-16 of this title and, in any event, possibility of exposure to civil liabilities sometime in futuro as result of complying with norms would not have amounted to that type of real and immediate threat of injury giving rise to actual case or controversy and, accordingly, court did not reach issue as to whether this part would unconstitutionally have exposed plaintiffs to

#### 2. Persons entitled to maintain action

Proper parties to raise constitutional objections to limitations of liability contained former section 1320e-16 of this title well-have been beneficiaries or recipients under medicare and medicaid programs, and only cian lacked requisite standing to challener constitutionality of such limitations ground that Congress lacked authority grant legal immunity against common and tort liability. Association of Am. Physicial and Surgeons v. Weinberger, D.C III.173395 F Supp. 125 affirmed 96 S.Ct. 388. - U.S. 975, 46 L.Ed.2d 299.

## § 1320c-7. Application of this part to certain State programs receiving Federal financial assistance

## (a) State plan provision that functions of peer review organizations may be performed by contract with such organization

A State plan approved under subchapter XIX of this chapter may provide that the functions specified in section 1320c-3 of this title may be performed in an area by contract with a utilization and quality control peer review organization that has entered into a contract with the Secretary in accordance with the provisions of section 1395y(g) of this title.

#### (b) Federal share of expenditures

In the event a State enters into a contract in accordance with subsection (a) of this section, the Federal share of the expenditures made to the contracting organization for its costs in the performance of its functions under the State plan shall be 75 percent (as provided in section 1396b(a)(3)(C) of this title).

(Aug. 14, 1935, c. 531, Title XI, § 1158, as added Sept. 3, 1982, Pub.L. 47-248. Title I, § 143, 96 Stat. 390.)

## UNITED STATES CODE ANNOTATED

Title 42
The Public Health and Welfare
§§ 1001 to 1399

1989
Supplementary Pamphlet
Covering Years 1984 to 1988
Replacing 1988 Supplementary Pamphlet

Includes the Laws of the 100th CONGRESS, SECOND SESSION (1988)

For close of Notes of Decisions See page III

For Later Laws and Cases Consult
USCA
Interim Pamphlet Service

MA: Friday

ST. PAUL, MINN, CO. WEST PUBLISHING CO.

lines for poet-review organizations were not fol-lowed, so that case, which resulted in doctor's suspension from receiving reimbursement for services rendered to Medicare patients should be remanded for administrative proceedings that complied with new rules, new rules or regulations did not apply retroactively to case, in which all of presuspension proceedings took place more than a year previously. Varandani v. Bowen, C.A.4 (Va.) 1987, 824 F.2d 307, certoran dismissed 108 S.Ct 1000. 98 L.Ed.2d 968

Action of Department of Health and Human terrices in promulgating regulation requiring medicare providers to incur without remoursement certain administrative costs of peer review, including photocopying, of their treatment of medicare patients, was not based on consideration enjoined from enforcing provisions of regulation which require hospitals to photocopy and deliver to peer review organization, without charge, all information required for peer review activities. Burlington Memorial Hosp. v. Bower, W.D.Wis. 1986, 644 F.Supp. 1020

of all relevant factors, so that Secretary would be

Substantial evidence supported five-year suspenmon of physician from participation in medicare and medicaid programs where body of relevant evidence supported finding that physician performed unnecessary surgery, prescribed inappro-priate or inadequate medication, and poorly documented necessity of admission or procedure Hall v. Bowen, W.D.Ark. 1986, 648 F.Supp. 16e, affirmed 830 F.2d 90e

#### ¿ 1320c-6. Limitation on liability

Rethinking medical malpractice law in light of Medicare cost-cutting. 98 Harvard L.Rev. 1004

#### § 1320c-9. Prohibition against disclosure of information

[See main volume for text of (a)]

#### (b) Disciosure of information permitted

An organization having a contract with the Secretary under this part shall provide in accordance with procedures and safeguards established by the Secretary, data and information-

(1) which may identify specific providers or practitioners as may be neces-38JV-

#### [See main volume for text of (A) and (B)]

(C) to assist appropriate State agencies recognized by the Secretary as having responsibility for licensing or certification of providers or practitioners or to assist national accreditation bodies acting pursuant to section 1395bb of this title in accrediting providers for purposes of meeting the conditions described in subchapter XVIII of this chapter, which data and information shall be provided by the peer review organization to any such agency or body at the request of such agency or body relating to a specific case or to a possible pattern of substandard care, but only to the extent that such data and information are required by the agency or body to carry out its respective function which is within the jurisdiction of the agency or body under State law or under section 1395bb of this title;

[See main volume for text of (2); (c) and (d)]

#### (e) Organizations with contracts

For purposes of this section and section 1320c-6 of this title, the term "organization with a contract with the Secretary under this part" includes an entity with a contract with the Secretary under section 1320c-3(a)(4)(C) of this title.

1988 Amendment, Subsec. (c). Pub.L. 100-360, § 411(e)(3), added section 4039(h)(6) of Pub.L. 100-203 which added subsec. (e). 1986 Amendment, Subsec. (b)(1)(C). Pub.L. 99-509, § 9353(d)(1), added "or to sessist national accreditation bodies action apparent.

creditation bodies acting pursuant to section

1395bb of this title in accrediting providers for purposes of meeting the conditions described in aubchapter XVIII of this chapter' added "or body" following "agency" wherever appearing, added "or to a possible pattern of substandard care" following "specific case", substituted "are



### GUAM MEMORIAL HOSPITAL AUTHORITY



850 GOV. CARLOS G. CAMACHO ROAD OKA, TAMUNING, GUAM 96911 TEL: 646-5801; 646-6876; 646-6711 thru 18 TELEX 671-6227, FAX 671-649-0145

# TESTIMONY BEFORE THE COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, WELFARE & ECOLOGY ON BILLS 1114 & 1115

February 13, 1990

Good afternoon, Madame Chair and members of the Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology:

The hospital's efforts to gain accreditation from the Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations later this year are in full swing. Our Capital Improvement Projects to upgrade our plant facilities and services are ahead of schedule, and our quality assurance monitoring mechanisms are in place.

During the last several years, the major emphasis for accreditation has been on QA activities. Bill Nos. 1114 Peer Review and 1115 Civil Immunity are certainly mechanisms which address concerns shared by many of the physicians as they review the delivery of patient care and services. Indeed, physicians are a critical part of quality assurance activities; and in some instances, accreditation has been denied because an institution's medical staff does not participate in these important activities.

The Bills, however, do not include other health professionals who participate in the Peer Review Process, and we would like to recommend that the Committee consider protection to these individuals as well.

The issue of peer review and immunity has been before this Committee, and we appreciate another opportunity to present our position on this issue. We need this legislation in order to encourage our Medical Staff and professionals to implement an effective review process which will assure quality patient care and services, and appreciate your favorable consideration.

ROSIE R. TAINATONGO
Chairperson, Board of Trustees





### GUAM MEMORIAL HOSPITAL AUTHORITY



850 GOV. CARLOS G. CAMACHO ROAD OKA, TAMUNING, GUAM 96911 TEL: 646-5801; 646-6876; 646-6711 thru 18 TELEX 671-6227, FAX 671-649-0145

TESTIMONY ON BILL 1114 & 1115 BEFORE THE COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, WELFARE & ECOLOGY

February 13, 1990

Good afternoon, Madame Chair and Members of the committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology:

Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony to Bills 1114 and 1115 which are critically needed and important pieces of legislation, related to Peer Review and Civil Immunity for medical review activities. These bills are timely because of the hospital's intensive efforts to gaining accreditation from national regulatory agencies. These bills will provide a mechanism for the hospital to protect the information contained in patient's medical records, keeping in mind the hospital's foremost responsibility for and obligation to is the patient.

There is a concern that should be addressed that may have been overlooked and this is related to the exclusion of other health professionals such as allied health professionals in these landmark pieces of legislation. These other professionals need to have mechanisms to protect the review of the quality of care they provide.

The hospital encourages this committee to recommend passage by the legislature of these pieces of legislation with appropriate modifications.

GEORGE B. PALICAN Hospital Administrator



### GUAM MEMORIAL HOSPITAL AUTHORITY



850 GOV, CARLOS G. CAMACHO ROAD OKA, TAMUNING, GUAM 96911 TEL: 646-5801; 646-6876; 646-6711 thru 18 TELEX 671-6227, FAX 671-649-0145

Honorable Madeleine Z. Bordallo Chairperson, Committee on Health, Welfare & Ecology Twentieth Guam Legislature Agana, Guam 96910

Dear Senator Bordallo:

We, the members of the GMHA Medical Staff, gratefully acknowledge your efforts in establishing physician peer review activities as privileged information. As physicians interested in improving healthcare for the people of Guam, we believe the following bills are urgently needed:

BILL NO. 1114 - "An Act to Authorize Certain Medical Peer Review Activites and to Establish Written Records of Peer Review Activites as Privileged Information."

BILL NO. 1115 - "An Act to Add a new Section 3285 to Article 1, Chapter 1, Part 1, of the Civil Code of Guam Relative to Civil Immunity for Participants in Medical Review Activities."

In order for GMHA to achieve accreditation by the Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations (JCAHO), physician peer review activities must be documented with follow-up action geared to improving patient care. The above-referenced bills, with necessary modifications will do much to assure confidentiality of records pertaining to peer review activities and credentialling of physicians.

We offer our assistance in securing passage of these important pieces of legislation.

Thank you for your attention to this important matter.

Si Yuus Maase.

The GMHA Medical Staff

cc: Governor Joseph F. Ada Speaker, Twentieth Guam Legislature All Senators of the Twentieth Guam Legislature Chairperson, Board of Trustees, GMHA We, the undersigned (members of the Guam Memorial Hospital Authority Medical Staff) support the passage of Bill No. 1114 and 1115 and concur with the attached letter addressed to the Chairperson, Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology, Twentieth Guam Legislature.

DRIVE DIRECTORN NAME	GTGWMWDD	2100
PRINT PHYSICIAN NAME	SIGNATURE	DATE
unterm mo	Mingrestin	1/31/90
MIGEL L. KENT MIS	1Q2en4	1/31/90
Hom A telepon M	Petry A. Peterson MD	41/90
Jose C. CARHACA	time	2/1/90
ERNESTE C.HQVINE	C) Light	7/1/9
James I tooller MI	Jadles Mr	-///9/
Stanley C. Clour, DDS	taken ( thin 128	2/1/90
Edmund & Schoolas I. M.	o A Schooli	2-1-90
THE RACCHES	James fredel	2/1/
Thomas Rozycki mo	T. Rozmen	2/1/90
R. Wade Covill MP	Syladi Carll mo	2/1190
JON DALLMAN DOS	put salle 10	2/1/90
J. ADJ MIS.	40	2/1/90
1 leche	(A- teche Mh)	1 Feb 90
- NixT	Johns May pm	2-1-90
J.V. SIRILAN	s. v. rice na	911 90
S. BRADLEY	Sorodley	2-1-90
L. D. BASILIB, un	Admin	2/1/90
Just Con		3/1/90
Edmon GALEY	/ E.mi	2/1/30
RPalt	COLOUL	2/1/50
JOHN DUNTOR	Merrily	2/1/40
LUIS 6 ALGUPUET	Lew Glegaler ag	71/9r
V-BATOFON	Batom.	2/1/40
MEDSTAFF	67	

We, the undersigned (members of the Guam Memorial Hospital Authorian Medical Staff) support the passage of Bill No. 1114 and 1115 and concurrent with the attached letter addressed to the Chairperson, Committee on Health Welfare and Ecology, Twentieth Guam Legislature.

		7
PRINT PHYSICIAN NAME	SIGNATURE	DATE
W. CHRIS POREZ	Sen	7.90
JOHN C STEELS	Christoto	130 - M
THE CHIVIN CRUZ	160	2/1/90
KINALD TABLANTE	laver ! Sell	2/6/40
A.L. SALCEDO	white Litters	L/13/50
CENSOLACION @ TRUIDAD	Constan O The God	2/13/90
(+: 13. +foring	74.7 5	2/13/90
Souch	5000	2/13/2
5. TOLENTINO	of hertu	7/13/21
JOSEPH N. NOZAKI	Hand h. hozelin	2/13/90
JAN A. BOLLINGOR	John Jackeyon 1111	2/17/90
Dobest J. Weinstein	At to be in the	2-13-90
n. B. Lowe-Roache	Nantta B. Lowe - Ruch	
L. Barilio	80000	2-13-40
S. RALLINGAL,	S. Carlin Gallergen	2/13/90
P.S. GUZMAN	Allman	2/12/90
A MATHEW	Anjath	2/13/90
Steven W Hildebrand mo	Alder fin	2/13/90
F. UZAMA	Gon	2/13/70
VINCENT LOZAMA	That Dan	0/13/90
Min chen	Kung Che	2/13/90
1. xlau-0	P-River	7/17/9
George Guthris M.D	( geoglithin)	2/13/90
- 5		, ,

MEDSTAFF

We, the undersigned (members of the Guam Memorial Hospital Authority Medical Staff) support the passage of Bill No. 1114 and 1115 and concur with the attached letter addressed to the Chairperson, Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology, Twentieth Guam Legislature.

PRINT PHYSICIAN NAME	SIGNATURE	DATE
Vincent A Duenas MD	meluluas m	5 Feb 90
athan Then Ono	Loerzel, Arthur J.	3/13/90
	7,	07/2/2
	-	

**MEDSTAFF** 



## GUAM MEMORIAL HOSPITAL AUTHORITY



850 GOV. CARLOS G. CAMACHO ROAD OKA, TAMUNING, GUAM 96911 TEL: 646-5801; 646-6876; 646-6711 thru 18 TELEX 671-6227, FAX 871-649-0145

April 4, 1990

#### MEMORANDUM

TO:

Associate Hospital Administrator

FROM:

Medical Staff Office

SUBJECT:

Petition: Bill 1114 & 1115

The information provided by one of the physicians during the 2/13/90 Public Hearing before the Committee on Health, Welfare and Ecology of the Twentieth Guam Legislature was a mistake. It was stated that there were 75 signatures on the petition of support for the passage of the above bills. There were only 49 signatures obtained. The attendance roster during the Medical Staff meeting on 1/25/90 may have been mistaken as the petition.

Thank you.

Mary Ellen Cruz, RN, CPQA

Supervisor

cc: Chairman, Executive Committee

COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, WELFARE AND ECOLOGY

		eb. 13,1990	
B:11	No.	1115	

NAME		TESTIMONY		AGENCY / INTEREST GROUP	COMMENT	
PRINT:	SIGN:	written:	ORAL:		FAVOR:	AGAINST
JOHN STEELE	- John Oliele			;		
FJ. WERTHMANN	Weithmann	<i>V</i>	<u></u>			
George Palican	Sand Br					
George Gether M.D.						
KENNETH R. WHITE	E. Kenneth Ral	lite V				
· ·						
				•	<del></del>	
•						
•						

#### COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, WELFARE AND ECOLOGY

DATE:	Feb. 13	1990	
B.11 No.	1114		
			-

NAME		TESTIMONY		AGENCY / INTEREST GROUP	COMMENT	
PRINT:	SIGN:	WRITTEN:	ORAL:		FAVOR:	AGAINST:
	(.)			·	·	
FJ. WERTHMANN MD.	Westhmann				<del></del>	
O. CRUZ, MD	Sauia Cu			GAI A		

# Introduced

DEC 28'89

# TWENTIETH GUAM LEGISLATURE 1989 (First) Regular Session

Bill No. ///4/Ccoz)

Introduced By:

M. Z. BORDALLO

AN ACT TO AUTHORIZE CERTAIN MEDICAL PEER REVIEW
ACTIVITIES AND TO ESTABLISH WRITTEN RECORDS
OF MEDICAL PEER REVIEW ACTIVITIES AS PRIVILEGED INFORMATION

1	BE IT ENACTED BY THE PEOPLE OF THE TERRITORY OF GUAM:
2	Section 1. A new §412 is added to Article 4 of Title 6
3	of the Guam Code Annotated to read:
4	"§412. Records of Medical Study of In-hospital Staff
5	Committees.
6	(a) In-hospital medical or medical-dental staff
7	committees of a licensed hospital may engage in research
8	and medical or dental study for the purpose of reducing the
9	morbidity or mortality, and may make findings and
10	recommendations relating to such purpose. Except as
11	provided in subsection (b), the written records of
12	interviews, reports, statements, or memoranda or such
13	in-hospital medical or medical dental staff committees are
14	subject to the provisions of title 6 of the Guam Code
15	Annotated and the Guam Rules of Civil Procedure (relating
16	to discovery proceedings) but, subject to subsections (c)
17	and (d), shall not be admitted as evidence in any action or
18	before any administrative body, agency, or person.
19	(b) The disclosure, with or without the consent of
20	the patient, of information concerning him to such
21	in-hospital medical or medical dental staff committees does

not make unprivileged any information that would otherwise 1 be privileged under said laws or rules, such information is 2 3 subject to discovery under subsection (a) except that the identity of any patient may not be discovered under subsection (a) unless the patient consents to such 5 6 disclosure. (c) This section does not affect the admissibility 8 in evidence of the original medical or dental records of 9 any patient. (d) This section does not exclude evidence which 10 11 is relevant evidence in a criminal action." Section 2. A new §413 is added to Article 4 of Title 6 12 of the Guam Code Annotated to read: 13 14 "§413. Proceedings and Records of Medical and Medical-Dental Staff Review Committees. 15 (a) Neither the proceedings nor the records of 16 organized committees of medical, or medical-dental staff in 17 hospitals having the responsibility of evaluation and 18 19 improvement of the quality of care rendered in the hospital 20 or medical or dental review committees shall be subject to 21 discovery. (b) Except as hereinafter provided, no person in 22 23 attendance at a meeting of any of those committees shall be 24 required to testify as to what transpired at the meeting. 25 (c) The prohibition relating to discovery or 26 testimony does not apply to the statements made by any 27 person in attendance at a meeting of any of those 28 committees who is party to an action or proceeding the subject matter of which was reviewed at that meeting, or to 29 30 any person requesting hospital staff privileges, or in any

action against an insurance carrier alleging bad faith by 1 the carrier in refusing to accept a settlement offer within 2 policy limits. 3 (d) The prohibitions in this section do not apply to medical or dental committees that exceed twenty-five 5 percent (25%) of the membership of the staff, nor to any of 6 those committees, if any person serves upon the committee 7 when his or her own conduct or practice is being reviewed. 8 (e) The provisions of this section do not exclude 9 10 the discovery or use of relevant evidence in a criminal action." 11 Section 3. A new §414 is added to Article 4 of Title 6 12 13 of the Guam Code Annotated to read: 14 "\$414. Proceedings and Records of Peer and Utilization 15 Review Committees. 16 (a) The proceedings, findings, deliberations, 17 reports, and minutes or peer review and utilization review committees concerning the health care provided to any 18 19 patient shall be considered privileged and not subject to 20 discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for 21 their release to any person or entity or be admissible as 22 evidence in any Judicial or Administrative action for 23 failure to provide appropriate care. 24 (b) Except as hereinafter provided, no person who 25 was in attendance of any such committee proceeding shall be 26 required to disclose any information acquired in connection 27 with or in the course of such proceedings or to disclose 28 any opinion, recommendation or evaluation of the committees 29 formed at any such meeting. 30 (c) The prohibition relating to discovery or

testimony does not apply to the statements made by any person in attendance at such committee meeting, who is party to any action or proceeding, the subject matters of which was reviewed at the meeting; or to any judicial or administrative action brought by a peer review committee or other legal entity formed to deny, restrict, or revoke hospital staff privileges, or licenses to practice as a physician or other health care professional; or such times when the committee may be sued for actions taken to deny, 10 restrict, or revoke the staff privileges, or license to 11 practice of a physician or other health care provider. 12 (d) The prohibitions in this Section do not 13 exclude the discovery or use of relevant evidence in any 14 criminal action; and shall not limit the authority to obtain such information by subpoena or other authorized 15 16 process from the committees for uses relating to matter and 17 investigations within the jurisdiction of health care

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

18

licensing boards."